वी॰ के॰ जिन्दल संयुक्त सचिव एवं मिशन निदेशक

V. K. JINDAL, ICOAS

Joint Secretary & Mission Director Swachh Bharat Mission

Tel.: (011) 23061630 E-mail: vk.jindal@nic.in





भारत सरकार आवासन और शहरी कार्य मंत्रालय निर्माण भवन GOVERNMENT OF INDIA MINISTRY OF HOUSING AND URBANAFFAIRS NIRMAN BHAWAN

> नई दिल्ली-110011, तारीख 20 New Delhi-110011, dated the 20

D.O No. 14/12 /2017-SBM-1

Date: 3rd November 2017

Dear Mission Directors,

As you are aware, Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs (MoHUA) under Swachh Bharat Mission has conducted series of workshops across states to handhold cities in their preparedness for Swachh Survekshan-2018.

- With respect of Swachh Survekshan-2018 indicators, States/cities have sought clarifications/shared concerns during workshops or through their letters.
- All such issues/queries have been carefully examined. The clarification/reply to these issues/queries has been given in Annexure-1.
- 4. Further, a list of 11 indicators, removed from Part 2-A 'Independent Validation' with justification, is given in **Annexure-2**.
- States/Cities may kindly take note of the above clarifications and align your
 Swachh Survekshan-2018 preparations accordingly.

.....contd. P/2

I look forward to your cooperation in making the Swachh Survekshan-2018 a success.

Yours sincerely,

(V.K. Jindal)

All Mission Directors of States/UTs

Copy to:

- 1. Municipal Commissioners/Executive Officers of all Urban Local Bodies
- 2. Principal Secretary (UD) of all States/UTs
- 3. Secretary, Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs

		Anne	xure 1: Ind	icator Specific Cla	rifications/modification	ns
Sr. No.	Section	Indicator Number	Tool Kit Page Number	Original Question	Issues	Proposed Changes/ Clarifications
1			Pa	rt 1: Service Leve	Progress	
1.	Collection and transportation	1.1	7	Of the Total Waste generated what percentage is segregated into wet and dry waste.	City has a waste to energy plant. So how will the marking be done then? If SWM project is based on WTE, there will be no generation of compost as the end product Wet and dry waste is collected in compartmentalize collection vehicles but no provision of separate compartment for hazardous waste as not generated on daily basis- collected in separate black bags as and when generated.	Concessionaire. Wet waste has to be mandatorily segregated per SWM Rules 2016. City can produce compo by segregating organic waste from the source. Source Segregation is mandatory as per SWM rules 2016. WtE plants may use commercially non-recyclable, dry, combustible waste only. Primary weightage given to segregation into wet and dry waste only and not on hazardous waste segregation.
	Collection and transportation	1.2			<1 Lakh population cities may not have RWAs/ Bulk Garbage generators. Whether RWA & BGG can send their waste to decentralized processing plant? Whether mobile composting is acceptable, like Excel composting van which is stated to be in use in Pune and can RWA & BGG send their biodegradable waste through mobile composting Van?	If not available, declaration from the Commissioner will be required and then question will not be applicable for those <1 lakh population cities. Centralized composting will be acceptable in these cities Yes, we can accept that as long as Bulk Garbage Generator pay user charges and ULB can provide receipts. BGG can also outsource the treatment to a third party or to ULB on payment as agreed upon.

					Waste collected every day is taken to SLRM centers for recycling. In small cities, the waste	In case of the ULB the payment given by BGG should not be less than the actual cost on commercial basis and financial cost. Solid Liquid Resource Management (SLRM) center near any RWA/BGG to be considered as on site treatment facility
					generation per capita per day will be less than 500 gms.	(decentralized system) Cities generating <300 MTD Organic Waste including domestic organic waste and Cities with <1 Lakh population can go for centralized/decentralized composting
3.	Collection and transportation	1.3	9	Percentage of Commercial areas undertaking daily sweeping and cleaning (twice a day, including night sweeping)	Is it sweeping twice a day or three times a day (night sweeping)? i.e., (two times sweeping in commercial areas in the day and one in the night)	In Twice a day Sweeping, Night Sweeping is mandatory.
4.	Collection and transportation	1.5	11	Percentage of collected waste transported to processing unit for disposal within the same day	City has huge variation in floating population. Therefore, huge variation in percentage on day to day basis	Monthly average of waste generated will be taken to assess if the same amount of waste is transported daily to the processing unit for disposal within the same day.
					It may also add transportation cost in situations where Tippers/ Waste transporting vehicles are only partially filled.	Further, floating population is a feature of only few cities. In all such places, city has to keep an account of the waste transported on daily basis. On special occasions cities are required to lift the extra waste generated.

5.	Collection	A				Waste generation criterican also be considered a per ULB study reports to verify record of waste collected from the city of daily basis.
	Collection and transportation	1.6	12	Percentage of Informal Waste Pickers formally integrated into Solid Waste Management (SWM) in the city (as per SWM 2016 rules)	The contract between Nagar Nigam and registered rag picker may not arise since the stipulation is the waste pickers are registered with an agency / SHG.	We can accept that, if there is any
5.	Collection and transportation	1.8	14	GPS/RFID based Vehicle Tracking – Recognition of best performing drivers [Permanent/Co ntractual] [% of waste picking vehicles/auto tippers follows daily route for waste collection]		GPS/RFID required in Only motorized vehicles Performance of drivers in cities with non-motored waste collection vehicles will get marks as per the proportionate percentage (%) received in question 1.4 (Door to Door Collection) Further, Mobile app based vehicle tracking system will be considered for assessing performance of the best performing drivers, provided we are able to verify through server.
					regard to awarding solid waste collection vehicles driver's performance there are no set criteria by	We are not prescribing anything from Ministry's side – any form of recognition/acknowledgement of their good work will be accepted.

					develop their own criteria. Likewise, the criteria for penalty are also not set by MoHUA and nagar nigam is free to develop its criteria.	е
7.	Collection and transportation	1.9	15	Placement of compartmental ized bins or twin bins at every 500m in commercial areas and emptied daily (as per SWM Rules 2016*)	Smaller cities may not have commercial area spread over a length of 500 m There are a number of Municipalities moving towards a Bin-less City. Citizens are fined for littering. These cities were concerned that they will lose marks in SS parameters relating to placement of segregated litter bins in public areas	Question Modification: Placement of compartmentalized bins or twin bins at every 500m in commercial areas and if area is less than 500m, at least 4 bins should be placed in the commercial area. The Commission/ Executive Officer will have to give declaration saying that their city is 'Bin Free City' supported by public notification. City will also explain the measures taken for making commercial areas liter free.
8.	Collection and transportation	1.10	16		The ICT salary verification is for nagar nigam staff only or for the outsourced contractors also? What are the broad types of attendance system which fall under ICT based system? Salary paid even when staff is absent for the allotted leaves + The issue of "casual Workers"- non regular workers	Yes – for both Any ICT based attendance system that does not permit human interface and attendance input can be printed. ULB can provide any supporting document (leave/ travel/salary deduction etc.) if staff was absent in previous month (Nov/Dec'17), to monitor the attendance.

9.	Collection and	1.12				Mobile based attendance system will also be considered instead of conventional bio-metric system.
3.	transportation		18	Percentage of city parks and gardens (maintained by government/p ublic department) practicing onsite composting of garden waste	Less number of gardens and smaller garden-size therefore not able to generate enough garden waste for on-site composting Is it mandatory to carry out composting in the park by machine? Is it acceptable if the park waste is given to mobile composting vans outsourced Some cities have various SLRM centers based on its population. Therefore most of the waste is taken to the nearest SLRM center for composting	Any type of composting will be considered but it has to be at the city park/garden site only. If park is
0.	Processing and Disposal	Section 2: 2.2	22		Some cities have adopted waste management	Such ULBs will get marks on the proportion (%) of marks got under the Indicator '2.3 - Percentage of Wet waste treated either by decentralized or centralized processing'. Zero landfill model by any ULB will be considered as a criteria for full marks. Revised marks are:

					and dry waste separately.	Scheme of Ranking Marks Sanitary landfill available and being used/ Zero landfill Model 60 Sanitary landfill under development 50 Agreement for development done but work not commissioned 40 Tenders called for development of sanitary landfill site 30 Land is identified 20 No action taken 0
11.	Processing and Disposal	2.3,2.4,2.	23,24,2	Percentage of Wet Waste treated either by decentralized or centralized processing	What is the criteria of wet and dry waste generation using per capita criteria?	being monitored by the ULB, Wet Waste is considered 50% of the total waste and total waste can be calculated using 450gm per capita per day (Manual on solid waste management CPHEEO and Report of Task Force on waste to energy –Kasturi Rangan
12.	Processing and Disposal	2.6	26	Remediation of existing dumpsites undertaken and the stage of the same	Shared-site or fee payment to nearby ULB site.	Report) Such ULBs will get marks, provided the shared landfill site is either being remediated, or the ULB has offered to pay its share for remediation to the landfill owner ULB. Question modified to accommodate such cities:
					Some cities have 100% recycling/ processing model of waste management therefore no new landfill.	Scheme of Ranking Remediation process started at landfill site / Remediation not required 40 Agreement for remediation completed or in progress 30 Tenders called for remediation work 20 No process started 0
13.	Processing and Disposal	2.7	27	Sale of city compost (as a % of production) in the last two quarters of 2017 as logged into the mFMS portal		In such a scenario, in documentary evidence supporting arrangements/agreement between the ULB and Horticulture Dept. is required - describing total compost produced by the city is absorbed for city gardens. In such cases compost will be treated as a part of the sale.

						Question Modification: Sale of City/ Self consumption (As a % of production) in the last one quarter of 2017 as logged into the mFMS portal.
14.		Section 3: 3.3	32	Are de-sludging operators registered and being monitored (e.g. by the ULB)	In small size cities ULBs may have their own vehicles that are engaged in de- sludging	In such a scenario, weightage will be given to the ULB having its own vehicle, provided proper log-book/activities are captured/monitored at ULB level
15.	Sanitation	3.4	33	Does your city have liquid waste processing infrastructure (FSTP or STP with cotreatment facility or septage)?	Smaller cities (generally with <1 lakh population) may not have plants within the city. They may be treating liquid waste in a cluster based approach outside the city.	If documentary evidence is provided, supporting such processing arrangements, full marks will be given. Definition of within city means within <100 kms of city boundary.
					No separate funding is available as of now for the construction of such FSSM plants for non-AMRUT towns. Therefore, the marks allocated to the same shall be Revised for non-AMRUT towns.	As Liquid Waste Management is a core function of the ULB, absence of central funding is not an accepted reason. ULBs may use PPP models, state funding, or FFC funds for the same.
16.		3.6	35	IHHL – What percentage of completed toilets have water connections?	Households may have different sources of water - water bills only possible is piped water supply is provided by the ULB	Water bill will not be mandatory - availability of water in the house from any source will be accepted.
.7.	IEC and Behavioral Change	Section 4: 4.1	42	rankings of Swachh Hotel,	Cities with <1 Lakh population may not have Hospital, RWA/Mohalla	Cities with <1 Lakh population will get full marks if they conduct ranking of Schools, restraunts and Markets otherwise Zero marks. In all cases of non-presence

18.	150 - 1			Association conducted		of any of the public places MC's declaration is requires.
18.	IEC and Behavioral Change	4.2	43	ICT Based Monitoring of Community and Public Toilets	Various constraints such as financial, technological and economical for implementing in cities with less than 1 Lakh population	Cities with <1 Lakh population may opt for feedback through google toilet locator or 'any form of feedback' – Feedback
19.	IEC and Behavioral Change	4.3	44	2017 SBM campaigns designed by the Ministry promoted in the city i.e. Source Segregation, Swachh Shauchalaya etc.	More clarity required	Shilpa Shetty (Source Segregation) hoarding around residential areas, Amitabh Bachchan (Composting) Hoardings around Hotels/Restaurants/ Bulk Garbage Generators and Suresh Raina (Public Toilet) hoardings at all Public/Community toilets
20.	IEC and Behavioral Change	4.4	45	SBM Brand Ambassadors - formally engaged for community engagement activities	Cities with <1 Lakh population may struggle to engage Brand Ambassadors	Any religious leader/Doctor/prominent personality of the city, who is willing to engage and drive citizens can be qualified as Brand Ambassador
21.	IEC and Behavioral Change	4.7	48	Facilitation of Farmer outreach programmes, Awareness drives and demonstration s for promotion of city compost within the ULB or in the surrounding villages	Cities with no farmers. E.g. NDMC. Only demonstrations of composting facility.	Farmers are seen as a market for compost and may not be from the city. The ULB should reach out to the farmers after collecting details from the Agriculture department. However, in case city is consuming entire compost produced within city itself, promotion to horticulture establishments and other similar consumers will be acceptable.
2.	Capacity Building	5.1	50	City Program Implementatio	Various constraints such as financial,	Cluster based PMU/PIU team or any dedicated

				n Unit (PIU) established - with at least IEC and MIS	technological and economical for implementing in cities with less than 1 Lakh population	team (within ULB) formed to support Swachh Survekshan will be acceptable. However, proper document is required supporting above claim.
22					Some states have large number of ULBs and therefore propose to establish one PIU for 2-3 ULBs	This cluster based approach will be considered for setting up of PIU units provided proper documentation is available.
23.	Innovation and best Practices	6 5	55	"Ministry of Housing & Urban Affairs (MoHUA) will award cities with outstanding performance and practices in the following categories"	More clarity required	City can submit One Project among the 5 categories given, to claim marks under 'Innovation and Best Practices'. The 5 broad categories will also capture best practices in categories such as: 1. Bulk Generation 2. Anti-littering measures 3. Grievances/ Redressal system 4. Decentralized Composting 5. Fecal Sludge Management 6. Integrated SWM practices 7. IHHL and CT/PT innovations 8. Any regulatory provisions, bye laws/ imposition of penalty ,etc 9. Exemplary efforts made by Civil Society Organizations, RWAs/ Institutions/ NGOs/ Individuals
				A: Independent V	alidation	
24.	Concern Area: <1 cities may not hav available for valid:	e sample size		Resolution: Numb population will eit	er of samples to be veri her use sample size give	fied in Cities with <1 Lakh

etc., whichever is lower.

available for validating progress claimed under 'Service Level Progress'

number of parks etc. claimed by the ULB OR actual number of parks

	e.g. there may available where parks to be che	eas for valida	oarks oation 9			
			P	art 2B: Direct Obs	ervation	
25.		9 to 17	109, 110, 111,112, ,113,11 4,115,1 16, 117	All Questions from 9 to 17 pertain to city Railway station or Bus station.	Some cities neither have Railway stations nor a bus stand.	Any public transport hub (Taxi/Auto stand) will assessed.
26.		10	110	Main Railway Station Catchment Area – Are litter bins placed in each shop in Main Railway Station? (Catchment and surrounding areas)	The shops in the railway stations are not coming under the control of ULBs. However, the marks has been allocated for source segregation by the shops in railway premises. Therefore, the marks towards the same shall be revised or the Ministry may take necessary action to bring the waste management in those shops to the preview of Municipal Authorities.	The indicator is for shops in the catchment area of Railway Station, i.e. within 500 meters of the same. Shops within Railway stations will not be assessed.
			F	art 3: Citizen Feed		
27.	Swachhata App	General Concerns		THE RESERVE OF THE PARTY OF THE	pading complaints	Speed is a function of connectivity at spot.
			fixed, as some of	applicant shall be applicants are sed complaints after a	Complaints reopened only within 12 hours will be considered. After lapse of 12 hours, reopening will not be permitted.	
				Mechanism shall the complaints ap complaints on SW		As of now, the categories in Swachhta App remain unchanged.
				Request to increa resolution time or from 12 hours to	the Swachhata app	The SLAs have been defined after extensive consultations and represent a reasonable time for ULBs to address the same.

28.	Swachhata App	1	126	Number of 'Swachhata App' download between Jan'17 – Dec'17	Swachh Survekshan- 2017 was underway till March 2017	The download period under assessment will be from 1 st April 2017 to 31 st December 2017.
29.	Swachhata App	2	127	What Percentage of complaints are resolved within SLA (Service level Agreement) timeframe	150 marks for 100% complaints resolved but only 75 Marks for 99% complaints resolved? Big gap between 100% and 99% of resolved complaints	An additional performance grade is added, given below- Scheme of Ranking Marks 90-100% complaints resolved 150 80-89% resolved 125 60-79% resolved 75 40-59% resolved 40 <40% resolved 0
30	Swachhata App	3	128	Is Your city featured in top-20 cities under 'Swachhata App' dynamic ranking	Some cities have raised the concerns on how the dynamic ranking is being calculated - as the bigger cities gets more marks basis their population size.	The Issues has been discussed with Janaagraha team and the same will corrected and make dependent on the % of population of the city. The same will be reflected on the dashboard. The change will be made effective from 1st April 2017.

General

Query:

- The word "Swachh Survekshan" shall be translated appropriately into the local language as people in some states such as Tamil Nadu are not aware of the word, however, they are aware of the equivalent word in the local language. The issue was raised by Tiruchirappalli Municipal Corporation, which had secured 6th rank in the last Survekshan.
- The citizen feedback calls do not have any provision for this and hence some states feel they may lose marks as a result of citizens not being able to comprehend the same. Additionally, they felt that the outbound calls are poorly translated adding to the issue. Therefore, local persons will be availed for conducting the citizen's feedback survey (including telephonic survey), as they might be able to translate the questionnaires into the local language and get the actual feedback of the citizens.

Clarification:

'Swachh Survekshan' has become a brand and it has been documented as 'Swachh Survekshan' only. Therefore, no translation can be permitted.

General Clarification:

 For some parameters, it is mentioned that data for last two quarters will be taken for assessment. However, the ministry will consider data for last quarter only i.e. Oct- Dec 2017

Annexure 2:
List of 11 indicators removed from Independent validation (Part- 2A)

Question No.	Question	Reason for Deletion
1.11	Spot Fine –Notification issued and fine collected	The challan/receipt signed by the offenders will be accepted as the proof. Don't require to ask offenders as they can deny
2.1	What percentage of the operational cost of Solid Waste Management is covered by Property Tax and User Charges?	Means of verification are enough to assess the scenario and hence no independent validation is needed
2.7	Sale of city compost (as a % of production) in the last two quarters of 2017 as logged into the mFMS portal	The data is available on mFMS portal and can be accessed by the agency
2.8	Has the designated compost manufacturer(s) in the city registered on the mFMS portal and are they logging production details?	The data is available on mFMS portal and can be accessed by the agency
3.7	IHHL – Percentage of applications that have been uploaded on the SBM portal?	The information is available on SBM portal, hence no independent validation is required
3.8	IHHL – What percentage of applications have been approved on the SBM portal?	The information is available on SBM portal, hence no independent validation is required
4.2	ICT Based Monitoring of Community and Public Toilets	The information can be accessed from the central server
4.4	SBM Brand Ambassadors - formally engaged for community engagement activities	Getting in touch with SBM ambassadors will be difficult considering their celebrity status
4.7	Launch of Farmer outreach programmes, Awareness drives and demonstrations for promotion of city compost within the ULB or in the surrounding villages	Means of verification are enough to assess the scenario and hence no independent validation is needed
5.3	eLearning Platform – Number of certifications undergone by ULB staff on the e-courses platform on SBM portal (Sanitary Inspector and Above)	MoHUA has access to central database for this data point, hence, no independent validation is required.
5.4	eLearning Platform — Number of certifications undergone by ULB staff on the e-courses platform on SBM portal (Asst/Jr.Engineer and Above)	MoHUA has access to central database for this data point, hence, no independent validation is required.